# Searching for the Perfect Musical Scale 

John Hooker<br>Carnegie Mellon University

October 2022

## Music and Mathematics

- Music is much more than mathematics and combinatorics.
- But almost all music relies on mathematical structure.
- ... even when we are not aware of it.



## Music and Mathematics

- Oldest known musical instrument uses tones with mathematical relationships.
- Prehistoric flute, from ice-age cave in Germany, 40,000 bce.
- Based on notes of pentatonic scale: frequency ratios $1, \frac{9}{8}, \frac{5}{4}, \frac{3}{2}, \frac{5}{3}$
- Same notes are in our modern scales!



## Music and Mathematics

- The 7 liberal arts
- Trivium - arts of the mind
- logic
- grammar
- rhetoric
- Quadrivium - arts of matter
- mathematics

- music (viewed as applied math!)
- geometry
- astronomy (applied geometry)


## Music and Mathematics

- All elements of music are based on mathematical structure:
- Harmony - mathematics of overtone series.
- Rhythm - e.g., Indian ragas
- Melody - combinatorial structure of Western polyphonic music.
- Scales - foundation for harmony, melody, counterpoint, key relationships, etc.



## Harmony

- Acoustic instruments produce multiple harmonic partials.
- Frequency of partial = integral multiple of frequency of fundamental.
- Coincidence of partials makes chords with simple ratios easy to recognize.

Perfect fifth C: $\mathbf{G}=2: 3$


## Harmony

- Acoustic instruments produce multiple harmonic partials.
- Frequency of partial = integral multiple of frequency of fundamental.
- Coincidence of partials makes chords with simple ratios easy to recognize.



## Harmony

- Acoustic instruments produce multiple harmonic partials.
- Frequency of partial = integral multiple of frequency of fundamental.
- Coincidence of partials makes chords with simple ratios easy to recognize.



## Polyphony

- A challenging combinatorial problem.
- Relationships among multiple voices must be intelligible to the ear.
- Classic example: Bach's chorale harmonizations.
- Al-based harmonization: follows some 350 rules, result tends to be mediocre.
- Human harmonization: requires a highly skilled composer, result can be beautiful and inspiring.


## Harmonization: Bach

## Passion Chorale

From St Matthew Passion (1727)
J. S. Bach

TB



## Harmonization: Bach




## Harmonization: Amateur



## Advantages of Classical Scales

- Pitch frequencies have simple ratios.
- Rich and intelligible harmonies
- Multiple keys based on underlying chromatic scale with tempered tuning.
- Can play all keys on instrument with fixed tuning.
- Complex musical structure.
- Can we find new scales with these same properties?
- Constraint programming is well suited to solve the problem.


## Multiple Keys

- A classical scale can start from any pitch in a chromatic scale with 12 semitone intervals.
- Resulting in 12 keys.
- An instrument with 12 pitches (modulo octaves) can play 12 different keys.
- Can move to a different key by changing only a few notes of the scale.



## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 0 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 5 from C major i.e., 5 notes do not
 occur in C major

## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 2 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 3 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 4 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 1 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 6 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 1 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 4 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 3 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 2 from C major


## Multiple Keys

Let C major be the tonic key
distance 5 from C major


## Multiple Keys

- Chromatic pitches ae tempered so that intervals will have approximately correct ratios in all keys.
- Modern practice is equal temperament.

$$
\frac{\text { freq of note } k}{\text { freq of note } 1}=2^{(k-1) / 12}
$$

## Multiple Keys

- Resulting error is $\leq \pm 0.9 \%$

| Note | Perfect <br> ratio | Tempered <br> ratio | Error <br> $\%$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| C | $1 / 1$ | 1.00000 | 0.000 |
| D | $9 / 8$ | 1.12246 | -0.226 |
| E | $5 / 4$ | 1.25992 | +0.787 |
| F | $4 / 3$ | 1.33484 | +0.113 |
| G | $3 / 2$ | 1.49831 | -0.113 |
| A | $5 / 3$ | 1.68179 | +0.899 |
| B | $15 / 8$ | 1.88775 | +0.675 |

## Combinatorial Requirements

- Scales must be diatonic
- Adjacent notes are 1 or 2 semitones apart.
- We consider m-note scales on an $n$-tone chromatic
- In binary representation, let $m_{0}=$ number of 0 s $m_{1}=$ number of 1 s
- Then $m_{0}=2 m-n, m_{1}=n-m$
- In a major scale 1101110, there are $m=7$ notes on an $n=12$-tone chromatic
- There are $m_{0}=2.7-12=2$ zeros
- There are $m_{1}=12-7=5$ ones

$$
\begin{aligned}
& 0=\text { semitone interval } \\
& 1=\text { whole tone interval ( } 2 \text { semitones })
\end{aligned}
$$

## Combinatorial Requirements

- Semitones should not be bunched together.
- One criterion: Myhill's property
- All intervals of a given size should contain $k$ or $k+1$ semitones for some $k$.
- For example, in a major scale:
- All fifths are 6 or 7 semitones
- All thirds are 3 or 4 semitones
- All seconds are 1 or 2 semitones, etc.
- Few scales satisfy Myhill's property


## Combinatorial Requirements

- Semitones should not be bunched together.
- We minimize the number of pairs of adjacent 0s and pairs of adjacent 1s.
- If $m_{0} \geq m_{1}$,
number of adjacent $0 \mathrm{~s}=m_{0}-\min \left\{m_{0}, m_{1}\right\}$ number of adjacent $1 \mathrm{~s}=0$
- If $m_{1} \geq m_{0}$,
number of adjacent $1 \mathrm{~s}=m_{1}-\min \left\{m_{0}, m_{1}\right\}$
number of adjacent $0 \mathrm{~s}=0$
- In a major scale 1101110, number of pairs of adjacent $0 s=0$ number of pairs of adjacent $1 \mathrm{~s}=5-\min \{2,5\}=3$


## Combinatorial Requirements

- Semitones should not be bunched together.
- The number of scales satisfying this property is

$$
\binom{\max \left\{m_{0}, m_{1}\right\}}{\min \left\{m_{0}, m_{1}\right\}}+\binom{\max \left\{m_{0}, m_{1}\right\}-1}{\min \left\{m_{0}, m_{1}\right\}-1}
$$

- The number of 7-note scales on a 12-tone chromatic satisfying this property is

$$
\binom{5}{2}+\binom{4}{1}=14
$$

## Combinatorial Requirements

- Can have fewer than $n$ keys.
- A "mode of limited transposition"
- Whole tone scale 111111 (Debussy) has 2 keys
- Scale 110110110 has 5 keys
- Count number of semitones in repeating sequence


## Temperament Requirements

- Tolerance for inaccurate tuning
- At most $\pm 0.9 \%$
- Don't exceed tolerance of classical equal temperament


## Previous Work

- Scales on a tempered chromatic
- Bohlen-Pierce scale (1978, Mathews et al. 1988)
- 9 notes on 13 -note chromatic spanning a $12^{\text {th }}$
- Music for Bohlen-Pierce scale
- R.Boulanger, A. Radunskaya, J. Appleton
- Scales of limited transposition
- O. Messiaen
- Microtonal scales
- Quarter-tone scale (24-tone equally tempered chromatic)
- Bartok, Berg, Bloch, Boulez, Copeland, Enescu, Ives, Mancini.
- 15- or 19-tone equally tempered chromatic
- E. Blackwood


## Previous Work

- "Super just" scales (perfect intervals, 1 key)
- H. Partch (43 tones)
- W. Carlos (12 tones)
- L. Harrison (16 tones)
- W. Perret (19 tones)
- J. Chalmers (19 tones)
- M. Harison (24 tones)
- Combinatorial properties
- G. J. Balzano (1980)
- T. Noll $(2005,2007,2014)$
- E. Chew (2014), M. Pearce (2002), Zweifel (1996)


## Simple Ratios

- Frequency of each note should have a simple ratio (between 1 and 2 ) with some other note
- Equating notes an octave apart.
- Let $f_{i}=$ freq ratio of note $i$ to tonic (note 1 ), $f_{1}=1$.
- For major scale CDEFGAB,

$$
\left(f_{1}, \ldots, f_{7}\right)=\left(1, \frac{9}{8}, \frac{5}{4}, \frac{4}{3}, \frac{3}{2}, \frac{5}{3}, \frac{15}{8}\right)
$$

- For example, B (15/8) has a simple ratio $3 / 2$ with $E(5 / 4)$

$$
\frac{f_{7}}{f_{3}}=\frac{3}{2}
$$

- D octave higher (9/4) has ratio $3 / 2$ with $G(3 / 2)$

$$
\frac{2 f_{2}}{f_{5}}=\frac{3}{2}
$$

## Simple Ratios

- However, this allows two or more subsets of unrelated pitches.
- Simple ratios with respect to pitches in same subset, but not in other subsets.
- So we use a recursive condition.
- For some permutation of notes, each note should have simple ratio with previous note.
- First note in the permutation is the tonic.


## Simple Ratios

- Let the simple ratios be generators $r_{1}, \ldots, r_{p}$.
- Let $\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right)$ be a permutation of $1, \ldots, m$ with $\pi_{1}=1$.
- For each $i \in\{2, \ldots, m\}$, we require

$$
1<f_{\pi_{i}}<2
$$

and

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{f_{\pi_{i}}}{f_{\pi_{j}}}=r_{q} \text { or } \frac{2 f_{\pi_{j}}}{f_{\pi_{i}}}=r_{q} \text { or } \frac{f_{\pi_{j}}}{f_{\pi_{i}}}=r_{q} \text { or } \frac{2 f_{\pi_{i}}}{f_{\pi_{j}}}=r_{q} \\
& \text { for some } j \in\{1, \ldots, i-1\} \text { and some } q \in\{1, \ldots, p\} \text {. }
\end{aligned}
$$

## Simple Ratios

- Ratio with previous note in the permutation $\pi$ must be a generator.
- Ratios with previous 2 or 3 notes in the permutation will be simple (product of generators)
- Ratio with tonic need not be simple.


## Simple Ratios

- Observation: No need to consider both $r_{q}$ and $2 / r_{q}$ as generators.
- So we consider only reduced fractions with odd numerators (in order of simplicity):

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{3}{2}, \frac{5}{3}, \frac{5}{4}, \frac{7}{4}, \frac{7}{5}, \frac{9}{5}, \frac{7}{6}, \frac{11}{6}, \frac{9}{7}, \frac{11}{7}, \\
& \frac{13}{7}, \frac{9}{8}, \frac{11}{8}, \frac{13}{8}, \frac{15}{8}, \frac{11}{9}, \frac{13}{9}, \frac{17}{9}, \ldots
\end{aligned}
$$

## Simple Ratios

- CP model readily accommodates variable indices

$$
f_{\pi_{i}}
$$

- Replace $f_{i}$ with fraction $a_{i} / b_{i}$ in lowest terms.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{3}{2}, \frac{5}{3}, \frac{5}{4}, \frac{7}{4}, \frac{7}{5}, \frac{9}{5}, \frac{7}{6}, \frac{11}{6}, \frac{9}{7}, \frac{11}{7} \\
& \frac{13}{7}, \frac{9}{8}, \frac{11}{8}, \frac{13}{8}, \frac{15}{8}, \frac{11}{9}, \frac{13}{9}, \frac{17}{9}, \ldots
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

alldiff $\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right)$
$\pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1$
$1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2$, coprime $\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m$
$\frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m$
$\bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m$
$\bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m$
$\frac{\left|a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}\right|}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m$
$\pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \hline \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \text { permutation } \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\mid a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \begin{array}{l}
\pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
\frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
\bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
\bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
\frac{\mid a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m \\
\pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{array}
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\left|a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}\right|}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m} \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\left|a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}\right|}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m} \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \quad \text { simple ratios } \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\left|a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}\right|}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m} \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\left|a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}\right|}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m} \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\mid a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m
\end{aligned}
$$

## CP Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { alldiff }\left(\pi_{1}, \ldots, \pi_{m}\right) \\
& \pi_{1}=a_{1}=b_{1}=1 \\
& 1<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}<2, \text { coprime }\left(a_{i}, b_{i}\right), i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{a_{i-1}}{b_{i-1}}<\frac{a_{i}}{b_{i}}, i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \bigvee_{j<i}\left[\left(\pi_{i}>\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \begin{array}{l}
\bigvee_{j<i}
\end{array}\left(\left(\pi_{i}<\pi_{j}\right) \Rightarrow\left(\frac{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}}{a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}} \in G \vee \frac{2 a_{\pi_{i}} / b_{\pi_{i}}}{a_{\pi_{j}} / b_{\pi_{j}}} \in G\right)\right], i=2, \ldots, m \\
& \frac{\mid a_{i} / b_{i}-2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}}{2^{\left(t_{i}-1\right) / n}} \leq 0.009, i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \pi_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, m\}, a_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, 2 M\}, b_{i} \in\{1, \ldots, M\}, i=1, \ldots, m \\
& \text { chromatic tone corresponding to note } i
\end{aligned}
$$

## Scales on a 12-note chromatic

- Use the generators mentioned earlier.
- There are multiple solutions for each scale.
- For each note, compute the minimal generator, or the simplest ratio with another note.
- Select the solution with the simplest ratios with the tonic and/or simplest minimal generators.
- The 7-note scales with a single generator 3/2 are precisely the classical modes!


## 7-note scales on a 12-note chromatic

Scale Solns Ratios with tonic Minimal generators

| 1. 0101111 | 27 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15} \frac{6}{5} \frac{5}{4} \frac{45}{32} \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{9}{8} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2. 0110111 | 10 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{18}{17} \frac{6}{5} \frac{4}{3} \frac{24}{17} \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Locrian mode |
| 3. 0111011 | 18 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15} \frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Phrygian mode |
| 4. 0111101 | 26 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15} \frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 5. 1010111 | 6 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3} \frac{45}{32} \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 6. 1011011 | 6 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5} \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Aeolian mode (natural minor) |
| 7. 1011101 | 10 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ | Dorian mode |
| 8. 1011110 | 27 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3}$ | melodic minor |
| 9. 1101011 | 14 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{5}{4} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{9}{8}$ |  |
| 10. 1101101 | 9 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{5}{4} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Mixolydian mode |
| 11. 1101110 | 17 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{5}{4} \quad \frac{4}{3} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Ionian mode (major) |
| 12. 1110101 | 10 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{5}{4} 4 \frac{45}{32} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9}$ | 32 $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 13. 1110110 | 16 | $\frac{1}{1} \quad \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{5}{4} \frac{45}{32} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{15}{8}$ | 32 $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Lydian mode |
| 14. 1111010 | 34 |  | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |

## 7-note scales on a 12-note chromatic

Scale Solns Ratios with tonic Minimal generators

| 1. 0101111 | 27 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32} \frac{8}{5} \quad \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{4} \quad \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2. 0110111 | 10 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{18}{17}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{24}{17} \frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Locrian mode |
| 3. 0111011 | 18 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{8}{5} & \frac{16}{9}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ $\frac{3}{2}$ | Phrygian mode |
| 4. 0111101 | 26 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{16}{9}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ | Single generator |
| 5. 1010111 | 6 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\begin{array}{lll}\frac{6}{5} & \frac{4}{3}\end{array}$ | $\frac{45}{32} \quad \frac{8}{5} \quad \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 6. 1011011 | 6 | $\begin{array}{lll}\frac{1}{1} & \frac{9}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{8}{5} \quad \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Aeolian mode (natural minor) |
| 7. 1011101 | 10 | $\begin{array}{ll}1 & \frac{9}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{16}{9}\end{array}$ |  | Dorian mode |
| 8. 1011110 | 27 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{15}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3}$ | melodic minor |
| 9. 1101011 | 14 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\begin{array}{lll}5 & \frac{4}{4}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{8}{5} \quad \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{9}{8}$ |  |
| 10. 1101101 | 9 | $\begin{array}{lll}1 & \frac{9}{8}\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{lll}5 & \frac{4}{3}\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{16}{9}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Mixolydian mode |
| 11. 1101110 | 17 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{15}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Ionian mode (major) |
| 12. 1110101 | 10 | $\begin{array}{ll}1 & \frac{9}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{45}{32}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{16}{9}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 13. 1110110 | 16 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \quad \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | Lydian mode |
| 14. 1111010 | 34 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{45}{32}$ | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{15}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{4} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |

## Other scales on a 12-note chromatic

| Scale | Solns | Keys | Ratios with tonic |  |  |  |  | Minimal generators |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. 111111 | 6 | 2 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{9}{5}$ |  |  |  |
| 1. 01010101 | $>50$ | 3 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15} \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ |  |  |  |
| 2. 10101010 | $>50$ | 3 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ |  |  |
| 21. 100001010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\begin{array}{llll}1 & \frac{9}{8} & \frac{6}{5}\end{array}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32} \frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{8}{5} \frac{5}{3} \quad \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | 22 | 2 | 2 | 2 |  |
| 22. 100010010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{8}{5}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{15}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | 22 | 2 | 2 | 2 |  |
| 23. 100010100 | $>50$ | 12 | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{1}{1} & \frac{9}{8} & \frac{6}{5}\end{array}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{8}{5}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{16}{9} & \frac{15}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | 22 | - | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 24. 100100010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{8}{5} \quad \frac{5}{3} \quad \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | , |  |  |
| 25. 100100100 | >50 | 4 | $\begin{array}{llll}1 & \frac{9}{8} & \frac{6}{5}\end{array}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 5 |  |
| 26. 100101000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ |  |
| 27. 101000010 | >50 | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\begin{array}{llll}5 & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{15}{8}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 |  |  |
| 28. 101000100 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5} \frac{16}{9} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $2 \frac{3}{2}$ |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 29. 101001000 | >50 | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | 2 | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 30. 101010000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\begin{array}{lll}1 & \frac{9}{8} & \frac{6}{5}\end{array}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \quad \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{16}{9} \quad \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{2}$ | 2 | 3 | $\overline{2}$ |  |

## Other scales on a 12-note chromatic

Scale Solns Keys Ratios with tonic Minimal generators

| 1.111111 | 6 | 2 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{9}{5}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

## Whole tone scale. Minimal interest musically



## Other scales on a 12-note chromatic

| Scale1.111111 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Solns } \\ 6 \end{array}$ | Keys | Ratios with tonic |  |  |  |  | Minimal generators |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | 2 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  |  | $\frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ |  |  |  |
| 1. 01010101 | $>50$ | 3 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{16}{15}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  | , | 5 $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ |  |  |  |
| 2. 10101010 | $>50$ | 3 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8} \quad \frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{6}{5} \frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5} \frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |  |  |

8-note scales. Only 3 keys.


## Other scales on a 12-note chromatic

| Scale | Solns | Keys | Ratios with tonic | Minimal generators |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1.111111 | 6 | 2 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ |$\frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4} \frac{5}{4} \frac{9}{5}$

9 -note scales beginning with whole tone interval

| 21. 100001010 | $>$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{4}{3} \frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | 5 |  |  |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 22. 100010010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | 5 | 4 | 3 | 8 | 5 |  |  |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 23. 100010100 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | 4 | $\frac{4}{3} \frac{3}{2}$ | 5 | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  |  |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 | 2 |  | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{3}{2}$ |  |
| 24. 100100010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $52 \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ |  |  |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |  |  |
| 25. 100100100 | $>50$ | 4 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ |  | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $5 \frac{5}{2}$ | 8 | 16 |  |  |  |  | - | - | - | - |  |  |  |
| 26. 100101000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $5{ }^{5} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  |  |  |  | 3 | 2 | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  |  |
| 27. 101000010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | 5 | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | 22 | $\frac{8}{5}$ |  |  |  |  |  | 2 | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | - |  |
| 28. 101000100 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\overline{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | 32 | $52 \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  |  |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 | 2 | 2 | 2 |  |  |
| 29. 101001000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | 45 | $52 \frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  |  |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 2 | 3 |  |  |
| 30. 101010000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $5 \frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ |  |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ |  | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ |  |  |

## Other scales on a 12-note chromatic

Scale Solns Keys Ratios with tonic Minimal generators


Most appealing scales. Simple ratios, good distribution of semitones.

| 22.100010010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 23.100010100 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 24.100100010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 25.100100100 | $>50$ | 4 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{9}{5}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 26.100101000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 27.101000010 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 28.101000100 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 29. 101001000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |
| 30.101010000 | $>50$ | 12 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{6}{5}$ | $\frac{4}{3}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{15}{8}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{5}{3}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | 9

## Other scales on a 12-note chromatic

| Scale | Solns | Keys | Ratios with tonic | Minimal generators |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | ---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1.111111 | 6 | 2 | $\frac{1}{1}$ | $\frac{9}{8}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{45}{32}$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ | $\frac{16}{9}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{5}{4}$ | $\frac{9}{5}$ |

Will illustrate this scale with a Chorale and Fugue for organ


## Demonstration: 9-note scale

- Chorale and Fugue for organ
- Chorale
- In A, cycles through 2 most closely related keys: A, C\#, F, A
- Modulate to $\mathrm{C} \#$ at bar 27
- Final sections starts at bar 72 (5:56)
- Fugue
- Double fugue
- First subject enters at pitches A, C \#, F
- Second subject enters at bar 96.
- Final episode at bar 164 (13:36)
- Recapitulation at bar 170


## Demonstration: 9-note scale

Key of A and 2 most closely related keys.


New notes are circled

## Chorale and Fugue

On a 9-note Scale
J.N. Hooker
Revised 2013

Chorale


## Chorale and Fugue

On a 9-note Scale


## Chorale and Fugue

On a 9-note Scale
Resolve from lowered $\begin{array}{r}\text { J. N. Hooker } \\ \text { Revised } 2013\end{array}$
Chorale submediant (F)


Chorale and Fugue
On a 9-note Scale



## Where does modulation

 to Db actually occur?

Where does modulation to Db actually occur?

$$
1.48 \quad \text { It occurs here }
$$



New key (Db = C\#)


$2^{\text {nd }}$ entrance at $\mathrm{C} \#$ but still in key of A


3rd entrance at $F$

Counter-

subject





-

 9
 \%



## Other Chromatic Scales

- Which chromatics have the most simple ratios with the tonic, within tuning tolerance?

| Ratio | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $3 / 2$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $4 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 4$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $7 / 4$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |
| $6 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $7 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $8 / 5$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $9 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |

## Other Chromatic Scales

- Which chromatics have the most simple ratios with the tonic, within tuning tolerance?

| Ratio | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $3 / 2$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $4 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 4$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $7 / 4$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |
| $6 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $7 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $8 / 5$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $9 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |

Classical 12-tone chromatic is $2^{\text {nd }}$ best

## Other Chromatic Scales

- Which chromatics have the most simple ratios with the tonic, within tuning tolerance?

| Ratio | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $3 / 2$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $4 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 4$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $7 / 4$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |
| $6 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $7 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $8 / 5$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $9 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |

Quarter-tone scale adds nothing 79

## Other Chromatic Scales

- Which chromatics have the most simple ratios with the tonic, within tuning tolerance?

| Ratio | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $3 / 2$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $4 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 3$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ |
| $5 / 4$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $7 / 4$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |
| $6 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $7 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ |
| $8 / 5$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ |
| $9 / 5$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ | $\cdot$ |

19-tone chromatic dominates all others

## Historical Sidelight

- Advantage of 19 -tone chromatic was discovered during Renaissance.
- Spanish organist and music theorist Franciso de Salinas (1530-1590) recommended 19-tone chromatic due to desirable tuning properties for traditional intervals.
- He used meantone temperament rather than equal temperament.



## Historical Sidelight

- 19-tone chromatic has received some additional attention over the years
- W. S. B. Woolhouse (1835)
- M. J. Mandelbaum (1961)
- E. Blackwood (1992)
- W. A. Sethares (2005)


## Demonstration: 19-note chromatic

- "Etude" by Easley Blackwood, 1980 (41:59)
- Uses entire 19-note scale
- Emphasis on traditional intervals
- Renaissance/Baroque sound
- Musical syntax is basically tonal
- We wish to introduce new intervals and a new syntax by using 11-note or other scales on the 19-note chromatic


## Scales on 19-note chromatic

- But what are the best scales on this chromatic?
- 10-note scales have only 1 semitone, not enough for musical interest.
- 12-note scales have 5 semitones, but this makes scale notes very closely spaced.
- 11-note scales have 3 semitones, which seems a good compromise (1 more semitone than classical scales).


## 11-note scales on 19-note chromatic

- There are 77 scales satisfying our requirements

$$
\binom{8}{3}+\binom{7}{2}=77
$$

- Solve CP problem for all 77.
- For each scale, determine largest set of simple ratios that occur in at least one solution.
- 37 different sets of ratios appear in the 77 scales.


## Simple ratios in 11-note scales



## Simple ratios in 11-note scales



These 9 scales dominate all the others.

## Simple ratios in 11-note scales

| Ratio | A B C D E | F G H I J K L M N O | P Q R S T U V |  | X Y Z abcdefghi j k |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 3/2 | $\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet$ | - • • • - • • • - | $\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet$ |  | $\cdots \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot \cdot$ |
| 4/3 | $\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet$ | - • - • - . . . | - . . . . . |  | - • - • - • . . . |
| 5/3 | $\bullet \bullet \bullet \bullet$ | . . . . . . . - • • | - - . |  | - • - . . . . - • - |
| 5/4 | - | - • - . . - • - | - | $\bullet$ | - |
| 7/4 | $\cdots \cdot \cdots$ | . . . . | - |  | - . . . . . . . . . . . . |
| 6/5 | - . . . - | - . . . . - | - - . . - • | - | - - - - |
| 7/5 | - - . - | - | - - • - • - |  | - . . . . . . . • • • • • |
| 8/5 | - | - - - | $\bullet$ - . - • . |  | - . . - . . . . . . • • |
| 9/5 | - - . | - - . . . - - - . | $\bullet$ | $\bullet$ | - . - . - . - . - . |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | A - 72 | K - 12,43 | U-57 |  | e - 13,29,44 |
|  | B - $69,70,71$ | L-28 | V - 42 |  | f - 60,61 |
|  | C-68 | M - 65,66 | W-26,27 |  | $\mathrm{g}-59$ |
|  | D - 74,75 | N-63,64 | X - 10,11,25 |  | h - 18,35,36,50,51,54 |
|  | E-7.8 | O-62 | Y - 5,6 |  | i - 17,34,49 |
|  | F-22,23 | P - 40,41,55,56 | Z - 15,31,32,46,47 |  | j - 58 |
|  | G-73 | Q - 20,21, $38,39,53$ | a - 14,30,45 |  | k - 16,33,48 |
|  | H-2 | R - 19,37,52 | b-9,24 |  |  |

We will focus on 1 scale from each class.

## 4 attractive 11-note scales

Scale Class Ratios with tonic Minimal generators


Showing 2 simplest solutions for each scale.
One with simplest generators, one with simplest ratios to tonic.

## Key structure of scales

| Classical major scale |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Note | 1 | $1 \#$ | 2 | $2 \sharp$ | 3 | 4 | $4 \#$ | 5 | 5\# | 6 | $6 \#$ | 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Interval |  |  | $2^{\text {nd }}$ |  | $3^{\text {rd }}$ | $4^{\text {th }}$ |  | $5^{\text {th }}$ |  | $6^{\text {th }}$ |  | $7^{\text {th }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Distance | 0 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 1 | 5 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Scale 23 of 9 notes on 12-note chromatic |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Note | 1 | 1\# | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5\# | 6 | 7 | $7 \#$ | 8 | 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Interval |  |  | $2^{\text {nd }}$ | m3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ | $3^{\text {rd }}$ | $4^{\text {th }}$ |  | $5^{\text {th }}$ | $m 6^{\text {th }}$ |  | $7^{\text {t }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Distance | 0 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Scale 7 of 11 notes on 19-note chromatic |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Note | 1 | 2 | $2 \sharp$ | 3 | $3 \#$ | 4 | 5 | 5\# | 6 | 7 | $7 \#$ | 8 | 8\# | 9 | 9\# | 10 | 10\# | 11 | 11\# |
| Interval |  |  |  | $2^{\text {nd }}$ |  | m3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ | $3^{\text {rd }}$ |  | $4^{\text {th }}$ |  |  | $5^{\text {th }}$ |  | $\mathrm{m} 6^{\text {th }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |
| Distance | 0 | 8 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 8 |
| Scale 27 of 11 notes on 19-note chromatic |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Note | 1 | $1 \#$ | 2 | 3 | $3 \#$ | 4 | 5 | 5\# | 6 | $6 \#$ | 7 | $7 \#$ | 8 | 8\# | 9 | 9\# | 10 | $10 \sharp$ | 11 |
| Interval |  |  |  | $2^{\text {nd }}$ |  | m3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ | $3^{\text {rd }}$ |  | $4^{\text {th }}$ |  |  |  |  |  | $6^{\text {th }}$ |  |  |  |  |
| Distance | 0 | 8 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 8 |
| Scale 56 of 11 notes on 19-note chromatic |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Note | 1 | $1 \#$ | 2 | $2 \sharp$ | 3 | 4 | $4 \sharp$ | 5 | $5 \#$ | 6 | $6 \sharp$ | 7 | $7 \#$ | 8 | 9 | 9\# | 10 | $10 \sharp$ | 11 |
| Interval |  |  |  |  |  | m3 ${ }^{\text {rd }}$ |  |  |  |  |  | $5^{\text {th }}$ |  | $m 6^{\text {th }}$ | $6^{\text {th }}$ |  |  |  |  |
| Distance | 0 | 8 | 3 | 5 | 6 | 2 | 7 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 7 | 2 | 6 | 5 | 3 | 8 |
| Scale 72 of 11 notes on 19-note chromatic |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Note | 1 | $1 \#$ | 2 | $2 \#$ | 3 | 3\# | 4 | 4\# | 5 | 6 | $6 \#$ | 7 | 7\# | 8 | 9 | $9 \#$ | 10 | $10 \sharp$ | 11 |
| Interval |  |  |  |  |  |  | $3^{\text {rd }}$ |  | $4^{\text {th }}$ |  |  | $5^{\text {th }}$ |  | $m 6^{\text {th }}$ | $6^{\text {th }}$ |  |  |  |  |
| Distance | 0 | 8 | 3 | 5 | 6 | 2 | 7 | 3 | 6 | 4 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 7 | 2 | 6 | 5 | 3 | 8 |

## Key structure of scales



## 4 attractive 9 -note scales

| Scale | Class | Ratios with tonic |  | Minimal generators |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 7. 01101011111 | E | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{25}{24} \frac{9}{8} \frac{6}{5} \frac{5}{4} \frac{4}{3} \frac{7}{5}$ | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{8}{5} & \frac{12}{7} & \frac{25}{18}\end{array}$ |  |
|  |  |  | $\begin{array}{llllll}\frac{3}{2} & \frac{8}{5} & \frac{12}{7} & \frac{13}{17}\end{array}$ |  |
| 27. 10101111110 | W | $\begin{array}{lllllllll}\frac{1}{1} & \frac{15}{14} & \frac{9}{8} & \frac{6}{5} & \frac{5}{4} & \frac{4}{3} & \frac{10}{7}\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{54}{35} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{9}{5} & \frac{27}{14}\end{array}$ |  |
|  |  |  | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{14}{9} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{9}{5} & \frac{35}{18}\end{array}$ |  |
| 56.11011110110 | P | $\begin{array}{lllllllll}1 & \frac{15}{14} & \frac{7}{6} & \frac{6}{5} & \frac{9}{7} & \frac{7}{5} & \frac{3}{2}\end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{llllll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{9}{5} & \frac{27}{14}\end{array}$ |  |
|  |  | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{13}{12} \quad \frac{7}{6} \quad \frac{6}{5} \frac{9}{7} \frac{7}{5} \frac{3}{2}$ | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{9}{5} & \frac{35}{18}\end{array}$ | $\frac{3}{2} \frac{13}{7} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{7}{5} 5 \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3} \frac{3}{2} \quad \frac{5}{3}$ |
| 72.11110110110 | A |  | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{9}{5} & \frac{35}{18}\end{array}$ |  |
|  |  | $\frac{1}{1} \frac{15}{14} \frac{7}{6} \quad \frac{5}{4} \frac{4}{3} \frac{7}{5} \quad \frac{3}{2}$ | $\begin{array}{lllll}\frac{8}{5} & \frac{5}{3} & \frac{9}{5} & \frac{27}{14}\end{array}$ |  |

Further focus on scale 72, which has largest number of simple ratios.

## Demonstration: 11-note scale

- Software
- Hex MIDI sequencer for scales satisfying Myhill's property
- We trick it into generating a 19-tone chromatic
- Viking synthesizer for use with Hex
- LoopMIDI virtual MIDI cable


## Harmonic Comparison

- Classic major scale
- Major triad C:E:G = 4:5:6, major 7 chord C:E:G:B = 8:10:12:15
- Minor triad $A: C: E=10: 12: 15$, minor 7 chord $A: C: E: G=10: 12: 15: 18$
- Dominant 7 chord G:B:D:F = 36:45:54:64
- Tensions (from jazz) C E G B D F\# A
- Scale 72
- Major triad 1-4-7 = 4:5:6
- Minor triad 5-8-12 = 10:12:15
- Minor 7 chord 9-12-15-18 = 10:12:15:18
- New chord 9-12-14-18 = 5:6:7:9
- New chord 1-3-5-9 = 6:7:8:10
- New chord 3-5-9-12 = 7:8:10:12
- New chord 5-9-12-15 = 4:5:6:7
- Tensions 1-4-7-10-13-15b-16-19-22


## 11-note Scales with Adjacent Keys

- There are eleven 11-note scales on a 19-note chromatic in which keys can differ by one note.
- As in classical 7-note scales.
- One can therefore cycle through all keys.
- This may be seen as a desirable property.
- The key distances are the same for all these scales.


Scales with most attractive intervals


That's it.

